An Evaluation of English language Teaching Programs in Indonesian Junior High Schools: A Case Study of the Yogyakarta Province

Yuyun Yulia
yuyun.yulia@ustjogja.ac.id
Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa
• Decentralization in Indonesia
  - First period 1999-2003 (Law 22/1999)

• Educational system
  - Law 20/2003 (National Education System)
  - Gov. Regulation 19/2005 (Eight Standards)
  - School categories
    - *Sekolah Potensial* (Formal Standard School),
    - *SSN* (National Standard School),
    - *RSBI* (Pilot School of International Standard); dismissed in 2013
Figure 1.2: Timeline of the School Curriculum Development in Indonesia

1945
1947 *Rencana Pelajaran Terurai*

1955

1965
1968 Primary Education Curriculum

1975
1975 The 1975 Curriculum
1984 The 1984 Curriculum

1985
1994 The 1994 Curriculum

1995
1997 Revision of 1994 Curriculum
2004 Competency-Based Curriculum (KBK)

2005
2006 School-Based Curriculum (KTSP)

2013 The 2013 Curriculum

Source: The Ministry of National Education
### Figure 1.1: The Structure of Indonesian Schooling

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MONET</th>
<th>MORA and MONET</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goverment School</td>
<td>Goverment School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private School</td>
<td>Private School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior High School/Vocational School 16-18 (3 years)</td>
<td>Senior High School/Vocational School 16-18 (3 years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madrasah Aliyah 16-18 (3 years)</td>
<td>Madrasah Aliyah 16-18 (3 years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior High School 13-15 (3 years)</td>
<td>Junior High School 13-15 (3 years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madrasah Tsanawiyah 13-15 (3 years)</td>
<td>Madrasah Tsanawiyah 13-15 (3 years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary School 7-12 (6 years)</td>
<td>Primary School 7-12 (6 years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madrasah Ibtidaiyah 7-12 (6 years)</td>
<td>Madrasah Ibtidaiyah 7-12 (6 years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kindergarten 5-6 (2 years)</td>
<td>Kindergarten 5-6 (2 years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playgroup</td>
<td>Playgroup</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kindergarten 5-6 (2 years)</td>
<td>Kindergarten 5-6 (2 years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playgroup</td>
<td>Playgroup</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Complicated Administration in DEOs (Haryanto, 2010)
### Aim and Question

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Aim</th>
<th>Main Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>…to investigate the English language policies and programs of the Indonesian government to junior high schools in Yogyakarta since the introduction of the KTSP in 2006</td>
<td>“How well have the English language policies and programs of the Indonesian government been implemented?”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Research Methodology

- Based on the evaluation methodology employed in two major Australian national education evaluation studies and partly as an extension of researcher’s experience as a school assessor of Indonesian government school as well as an English language assessor and a teacher trainer of teacher certification program.

- This research is an evaluation and applies mixed methods techniques. The aim of evaluation is to examine a policy or a process or a product (Cahill:1986)

- Participants: four districts and one municipality, MONE: 420 schools, MORA: 84 Islamic schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yogya</th>
<th>Sleman</th>
<th>Bantul</th>
<th>KlNprogo</th>
<th>Gngkidul</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 public</td>
<td>RSBI</td>
<td>SSN</td>
<td>1 public</td>
<td>SSN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 private</td>
<td>RSBI</td>
<td>SP</td>
<td>1 private</td>
<td>SP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 private Mts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

UST
Research Strategy

• Consultation with national, regional and local education officials responsible for the implementation of KTSP curriculum in the school under their responsibility (9 in number),

• Consultation with English language academics in four Yogyakarta universities responsible for the training of English language teachers (6 in number)

• As the key central, case studies of twelve systematic sampling (Kemper et al., 2003; Cohen, et al., 2007; Gay et al., 2009) junior secondary schools
Findings: School Staff Performance

1. Principal: Their Leadership Failures

- Focus on management, not leadership
- Delegate responsibilities (internal) to vice principals
- Incompetence of principals in ‘revising’ and implementing the curriculum
  - Teaching hours
  - Minimum passing grade
  - Selection of the local content
- Inadequate capacity of teacher’s assessment
- ‘Limited’ supervision in terms of quantity and quality
- A ‘copy paste’ curriculum
2. Teacher

- Teacher certification program (Indonesian Law No. 14/2005, Government Regulation No. 74/2008 and MONE No. 39/2009)
- Teacher workload
- Incompetence of teachers in ‘revising’ and implementing the curriculum
- Certified teachers: 71 % with an average teaching experience of 18 years and 9 % with 6 year teaching experience
- Incompetent as good models of the English language and learning assessment
Findings…
Teachers’ Classroom Language

- Based on the 25 teachers’ responses,
  45 % said English, 50 % mixture, 5 % Bahasa Indonesia.

- Students’ responses,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Agree (%)</th>
<th>So-so (%)</th>
<th>Disagree (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English in class</td>
<td>69.7</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English in school environment</td>
<td>52.1</td>
<td>37.4</td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Based on the observation,
  - Greeting in English
  - Translation English into Indonesian
  - Indonesian
  - Javanese
• Inadequate knowledge of ELT paradigm, such as CLT, macro and micro skills, curricula, pedagogical and professional (language proficiency) competences, incapability to use modern language equipment (IT-based)

• Teachers’ incapacity to develop their own teaching materials

“Basically books are provided by the government. Teachers can adapt; however, teachers use more LKS written by incompetent writers and it does not go through a good selection process. Syllabus and lesson plans are for the purpose of official documentation”

• Lack of learning resources in rural schools

• Rarely participate in in-service training

• Almost all teachers in the 12 CS aimed at teaching English for the national examination
Conclusion

1. The decentralized system in education created challenges:
   ▪ the lack of capacity at local level to assume responsibilities from the central government,
   ▪ the ‘culture’ of conditioning individuals to follow orders from the top, implementing rather than initiating or designing policy.

   “Many educators, socialized during the Soeharto period, regard the devolution reforms as merely another central government edict to which the usual safe response is verbal acquiescence without any significant change in behavior” (Bjork, 2006).
2. Whilst the vision and mission of the government in respect of ELT in Indonesian high schools is clearly outlined, the disjuncture between the district level and the individual schools is resulting in confusion of roles and responsibility.

3. In terms of school leaderships, schools principals generally lack curriculum competence, their deficient supervision of teachers, and their lack of encouragement of teacher professionalism.

4. Teachers’ incapacity in ELT, pre-service training, professional collegiality, and lack of in-service trainings,
5. The damaging tension of the curriculum aims and the national examination,

6. Lack of motivation for both teachers and students to communicate in English to others as the impact of globalization. Either teachers or students paid attention to English language as one of the core subjects in the national examination,

7. Insufficient appreciation, especially in rural schools, of the global cultural and economic imperative for Indonesian students to be proficient in English in a trilingual context,

8. The lack of systematic evaluation of the implementation of ELT elements and also predecessor curricula and their underlying administrative philosophies,
Recommendation

• The national education system need to be redesigned in the context of decentralization

• MONE should have a clear picture of how local actors react to newly created opportunities to shape policy and practice in the schools. Bjork (2004) witnessed educators experience difficulty as they attempted to implement the reform due to lack of support from the MONE.

• Bjork (2006) contended,

“If the government is indeed committed to decentralization, it is imperative that more attention be paid to the implications of reform plans for local agencies and actors. Upper level officials will need to gain a deeper understanding of the conditions in which their policies are enacted. Their methods of training school-based employees must be revised so as to prepare those people to lead rather than to follow.”

• Globalization brings about various issues concerning the teaching of ELT

• Professional collegial initiatives